**Supplementary material for**

Comparison of biofuel life-cycle GHG emissions assessment tools: the case studies of ethanol produced from sugarcane, corn, and wheat

Pereira, L.G.1,2\*, Cavalett, O.1, Bonomi, A.1,3, Zhang, Y.4, Warner, E.4, Chum, H.L.4

1Brazilian Bioethanol Science and Technology Laboratory, Brazilian Center of Research in Energy and Materials, Campinas, SP, Brazil

2Department of Civil and Mineral Engineering, University of Toronto, Toronto, ON, Canada

3School of Chemical Engineering, University of Campinas, Campinas, SP, Brazil

4National Renewable Energy Laboratory, Golden, CO, USA

\*Corresponding author: E-mail address: lucgpereira@gmail.com / lucasg.pereira@utoronto.ca

**Versions of the models used:**

GREET 2016

GHGenius 4.03 (2013)

BioGrace 1-4d (updated 2016)

VSB 2015

**Table 1S**. Agricultural and industrial inputs for sugarcane ethanol production

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | GREETa | GHGeniusb | BioGracec | VSBd |
| **Inputs per tonne of sugarcane** |  |  |  |  |
| N fertilizer (kg) | 0.80 | 1.08 | 0.91 | 1.23 |
| P2O5 fertilizer (kg) | 0.30 | 0.58 | 0.41 | 0.14 |
| K2O fertilizer (kg) | 1.00 | 1.47 | 1.08 | 1.31 |
| Limestone (kg) | 5.20 | 11.65e | 5.34 | 5.00 |
| Pesticides, herbicides, insecticides (g) | 47.5 | 5.1 | 29.1 | 16.7 |
| Seedlings (kg) | - | 30.3 | 29.1 | 44.1 |
| Diesel (machinery operation) (L) | 1.1 | 2.9 | 0.8 | 1.9 |
|  |  |  |  |  |
| **Inputs per L of ethanol** |  |  |  |  |
| Sulfuric acid (g) | - | 7.40 | 16.06 | 4.94 |
| Lime (g) | 10.85 | 11.00 | 17.97 | 7.48 |
| Cyclohexane (g) | - | - | 1.06 | 0.71 |
| Phosphoric acid (g) | - | - | - | 2.70 |
| Inorganic chemicals (g) | - | - | - | 0.044 |
| Zeolites (g) | - | - | - | 0.047 |

aSeabra et al. [1] apud Wang et al.[2];

bBased on average values from three studies [1,3,4], except for diesel use;

cBased on Macedo et al. [3]; a factor of +40% is applied to industrial inputs for BioGrace to encourage voluntary contribution from the private sector;

dBased on experts’ recommendations and literature;

eThe amount of limestone considered within GHGenius is an average value calculated based on Seabra et al. [1] with 450 kg CaO ha-1, Macedo et al. [3] with 366 kg CaO ha-1 and Macedo et al. [4] with 1,900 kgCaO ha-1, resulting in a much larger value than those assumed for the other models.

**Table 2S**. Main agricultural and industrial inputs for corn ethanol production

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | GREETa | GHGenius | BioGraceb |
| **Inputs per tonne of corn** |  |  |  |
| N fertilizer (kg) | 16.7 | 17.2 | 13.3 |
| N in animal manure (kg) | - | 1.9 | - |
| P2O5 fertilizer (kg) | 5.7 | 5.0 | 8.9 |
| K2O fertilizer (kg) | 6.0 | 6.9 | 6.6 |
| Limestone (kg) | 45.3 | - | 412.0 |
| Pesticides, herbicides, insecticides (g) | 277.8 | 312.3 | 618.0 |
| Seeds (kg) | - | 2.32 | - |
| Diesel (machinery operation) (L) | 4.2 | 4.8 | 26.3 |
| Natural gas (L) | 2.1 | 8,706 | - |
| LPG (L) | 1.7 | 4.8 | - |
| Electricity (MJ) | 17.4 | - | - |
|  |  |  |  |
| **Inputs per L of ethanol** |  |  |  |
| Electricity (MJ) | 0.7 | 0.9 | -8.0 |
| Natural gas (MJ) | 6.1 | 7.9 | 27.1 |
| Coal (MJ) | 0.53 | 1.8 | - |
| Alpha-amylase (g) | 0.657 | - | - |
| Glucoamylase (g) | 1.41 | - | - |
| Ammonia (g) | 4.67 | 21.6 | - |
| Enzymes (g) | - | 5.0 | - |
| Sodium hydroxide (g) | 5.85 | 5.8 | - |
| Sulfuric acid (g) | 4.67 | 10.9 | - |
| Calcium oxide (g) | 2.8 | - | - |
| Yeast (g) | 0.71 | 3.5 | - |

aGREET considers three types of corn mills existent in the U.S. for the production of ethanol: dry mill without corn oil extraction (17.72%); dry mill with corn oil extraction (70.88%); and wet mill (11.40%) [5].

bA factor of +40% is applied to industrial inputs for BioGrace to encourage voluntary contribution from the private sector; Electricity coproduced with required steam is accounted as a credit to the product system.

**Table 3S**. Main agricultural and industrial inputs for wheat ethanol production

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | GHGenius | BioGracea |
| **Inputs per tonne of wheat** |  |  |
| N fertilizer (kg) | 18.0 | 21.0 |
| P2O5 fertilizer (kg) | 10.3 | 4.2 |
| K2O fertilizer (kg) | 0.83 | 3.1 |
| Sulphur fertilizer (kg) | 0.22 | - |
| Pesticides, herbicides, insecticides (g) | 316.1 | 448.3 |
| Seeds (kg) | 43.8 | 23.0 |
| Diesel (machinery operation) (L) | 8.5 | 19.8 |
|  |  |  |
| **Inputs per L of ethanol** |  |  |
| Electricity (MJ) | 10.8 | -5.6 |
| Natural gas (MJ) | 13.4 | 20.2 |
| Ammonia (g) | 13.9 | - |
| Enzymes (g) | 5.5 | - |
| Sodium hydroxide (g) | 1.6 | - |
| Sulfuric acid (g) | 4.9 | - |
| Yeast (g) | 4.0 | - |

aA factor of +40% is applied to industrial inputs for BioGrace to encourage voluntary contribution from the private sector. Industrial inputs considering a configuration with steam production from a natural gas CHP system.

**Table 4S.** Agricultural and processing yields assumed by the LCA models investigated in this study

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | GREET | GHGenius | BioGrace | VSB |
| **Sugarcane** |  |  |  |  |
| Agricultural yield (tonne/ha) | 86.7 | 85.3 | 68.7 | 80.0 |
| Ethanol yield (L/tonne of cane) | 81.0 | 80.0 | 87.0 | 85.2 |
| Surplus electricity (kWh/tonne of cane) | 75.0 | 10.7 | - | 26.1 |
|  |  |  |  |  |
| **Corn** |  |  |  |  |
| Agricultural yield (tonne/ha) | 10.5 | 11.1 | 3.88 | - |
| Ethanol yield (L/tonne of corn) | 426.3 | 405.0 | 448.2 | - |
| DDGSa (kg/tonne of corn) | 274.5 | 288.8 | 495.5 | - |
|  |  |  |  |  |
| **Wheat** |  |  |  |  |
| Agricultural yield (tonne/ha) | - | 2.80 | 5.21 | - |
| Ethanol yield (L/tonne of wheat) | - | 428.0 | 436.4 | - |
| DDGSa (kg/tonne of wheat) | - | 376.4 | 349.2 | - |

aDistiller's dried grains with solubles

**Table 5S**. Industrial inputs for corn ethanol production considered by the GREET model (per L of ethanol)

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Unit | Dry mill w/o corn oil extraction | Dry mill with corn oil extraction | Wet  mill |
| Alpha amylase | g | 0.66 | 0.66 | 0.71 |
| Gluco amylase | g | 1.43 | 1.42 | 1.53 |
| Yeast | g | 0.72 | 0.72 | 0.77 |
| Sulfuric acid | g | 1.23 | 1.22 | 1.31 |
| Ammonia | g | 4.71 | 4.67 | 5.03 |
| Sodium hydroxide | g | 5.91 | 5.86 | 6.31 |
| Calcium oxide | g | 2.82 | 2.79 | 3.01 |
| Natural gas | MJ | 6.24 | 6.12 | 9.56 |
| Electricity | MJ | 0.71 | 0.70 | 0.00 |
| Coal | MJ | 0.54 | 0.53 | 3.62 |

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Stage | Sugarcane | | | | Corn | | | Wheat | |
| GREET | GHGenius | BioGrace | VSB | GREET | GHGenius | BioGrace | GHGenius | BioGrace |
| Farming | 12.2 | 27.1 | 13.6 | 14.7 | 29.4 | 35.6 | 20.1 | 38.5 | 23.3 |
| N2O emissions (fertilizers and residues) | 3.0 | 10.8 | 3.3 | 7.9 | 16.2 | 20.2 | 4.3 | 21.0 | 7.8 |
| NPK fertilizer manufacture | 1.7 | 4.9 | 3.3 | 2.1 | 6.8 | 8.8 | 6.2 | 12.7 | 9.4 |
| Limestone | 1.3 | 4.9 | 0.4 | 0.9 | 1.1 | 0.0 | 3.6 | 0.0 | 0.0 |
| Straw burning | 0.9 | 0.0 | 4.9 | 1.0 | - | - | - | - | - |
| Energy and fuel | 4.3 | 7.8 | 1.3 | 2.2 | 3.8 | 6.6 | 5.5 | 4.8 | 4.8 |
| Other inputs | 1.1 | 0.7 | 0.4 | 0.6 | 1.5 | 0.0 | 0.5 | 0.0 | 1.3 |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Feedstock transportation | 1.1 | 2.3 | 1.0 | 1.1 | 1.9 | 1.6 | 0.3 | 1.8 | 0.4 |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Ethanol production | 2.3 | 5.8 | 0.9 | 0.7 | 37.8 | 37.3 | 21.5 | 48.8 | 19.3 |
| Lime | 0.7 | 0.2 | 0.7 | 0.4 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 |
| Bagasse combustion | 0.0 | 5.1 | 0.0 | 0.0 | - | - | - | - | - |
| Natural gas | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 19.7 | 21.8 | 21.5 | 38.3 | 18.9 |
| Electricity | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 4.6 | 5.9 | 0.0 | 8.2 | 0.0 |
| Coal | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 4.2 | 6.5 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 |
| Other inputs | 1.6 | 0.5 | 0.2 | 0.3 | 9.3 | 3.5 | 0.0 | 2.3 | 0.4 |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Ethanol shipping | 7.2 | 8.1 | 4.1 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Ethanol ground transportation | 1.0 | 2.6 | 3.1 | 1.0 | 1.2 | 1.6 | 1.5 | 1.6 | 1.5 |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Use | 0.2 | 2.2 | - | 0.1 | 0.2 | 2.1 | - | 2.1 | - |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Co-product credit | - | -4.3 | - | - | -12.8 | -16.7 | - | -24.5 | - |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Net impact | 24.0 | 45.1 | 23.0 | 16.1 | 57.7 | 61.9 | 43.4 | 68.3 | 44.5 |

**Table 6S.** Allocated greenhouse gases emissions impacts per stage for the models investigated (in grams of CO2eq per MJ of ethanol)

**Table 7S**. Methods and parameters for dealing with co-products in the different models

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | GREET | GHGenius | BioGrace | VSB |
| Default method for treatment of coproducts | Substitutiona  Energyb | Substitutionc | Energyd | Economice |
| Partitioning/credit |  |  |  |  |
| Sugarcane |  |  |  |  |
| Ethanol | 95.0% | 100% | 100% | 96.5% |
| Electricity | 5.0% | -4.3 g CO2eq MJ-1 | - | 3.5% |
| Corn |  |  |  |  |
| Ethanol | 100% | 100% | 54.6% | - |
| DDGSh | -12.8 g CO2eq MJ-1 | -16.7 g CO2eq MJ-1 | 45.4% | - |
| Wheat |  |  |  |  |
| Ethanol | - | 100% | 59.5% | - |
| DDGSf | - | -24.5 g CO2eq MJ-1 | 40.5% | - |

aSubstitution method in the GREET model is utilized for corn and wheat coproducts; whereas energy allocation is applied to surplus electricity generated in sugarcane ethanol production; surplus electricity of 75.0 kWh tonne of sugarcane-1 in 2015 is considered for sugarcane ethanol production; three types of mills are considered for the production of corn ethanol in the U.S.: dry mills with and without corn oil extraction representing 70.9% and 17.7%, respectively, and wet mills representing 11.4% of total mills; in addition to ethanol, dry mills produce DDGS that displace 78.12% corn, 30.72% soybean meal and 2.27% urea; whereas wet mills produce corn gluten meal (CGM) displacing 152.90% corn and 2.33% urea, corn gluten feed (CGF) displacing 100% corn and 1.52% urea, and corn oil displacing 100% soy oil;

bEnergy content of ethanol (LHV) = 21.3 MJ L-1;

cSubstitution method in GHGenius considers a credit equivalent to surplus electricity produced (10.7 kWh tonne of sugarcane-1) for sugarcane; credit equivalent to the DDGS produced (0.29 kg DDGS kg corn-1 and 0.38 kg DDGS kg wheat-1) displacing 0.78 kg corn kg DDGS-1 and 0.31 kg soybean meal kg DDGS-1 for corn and 0.45 kg wheat kg DDGS-1 and 0.55 kg soybean meal kg DDGS-1 for wheat; in addition to avoided CH4 emissions (3.74 g CH4 kg DDGS-1 equivalent to 2.8 g CO2eq MJ-1 of corn ethanol and 4.0 g CO2eq MJ of wheat ethanol-1);

dEnergy content of ethanol (LHV) = 26.8 MJ kg-1; energy content of dry DDGS = 16.0 MJ kg-1;

eEthanol price = 1.56 R$ L-1 (0.49 US$ L-1); electricity price = 182.5 R$ MWh-1 (57.03 US$ MWh-1), assuming US$ 1.00 = R$ 3.20;

fDistiller's dried grains with solubles.

**References**

[1] Seabra JEA, Macedo IC, Chum HL, Faroni CE, Sarto CA. Life cycle assessment of Brazilian sugarcane products: GHG emissions and energy use. Biofuels, Bioprod Biorefining 2011;5:519–32. doi:10.1002/bbb.289.

[2] Wang L, Quiceno R, Price C, Malpas R, Woods J. Economic and GHG emissions analyses for sugarcane ethanol in Brazil: Looking forward. Renew Sustain Energy Rev 2014;40:571–82. doi:10.1016/j.rser.2014.07.212.

[3] Macedo, IC, Leal MRLV, da Silva J. Greenhouse gases emissions in the production and use of ethanol from sugarcane in Brazil (in Portuguese) 2004.

[4] Macedo IC, Seabra JEA, Silva JEAR. Green house gases emissions in the production and use of ethanol from sugarcane in Brazil: The 2005/2006 averages and a prediction for 2020. Biomass and Bioenergy 2008;32:582–95. doi:10.1016/j.biombioe.2007.12.006.

[5] Wang M, Wu M, Huo H. Life-cycle energy and greenhouse gas emission impacts of different corn ethanol plant types. Environ Res Lett 2007;2:024001. doi:10.1088/1748-9326/2/2/024001.